

JENNER & BLOCK

*Practice Series*

# Protecting Confidential Legal Information

A Handbook for Analyzing Issues Under  
The Attorney-Client Privilege And  
The Work Product Doctrine

David M. Greenwald

# JENNER & BLOCK LLP

## OFFICES

- 353 North Clark Street  
Chicago, Illinois 60654-3456  
Firm: 312 222-9350  
Fax: 312 527-0484
- 633 West Fifth Street, Suite 3500  
Los Angeles, California 90071  
Firm: 213 239-5100  
Fax: 213 239-5199
- 919 Third Avenue, 37th Floor  
New York, New York 10022-3908  
Firm: 212 891-1600  
Fax: 212 891-1699
- 1099 New York Avenue, N.W., Suite 900  
Washington, D.C. 20001-900  
Firm: 202 639-6000  
Fax: 202 639-6066

WEBSITE: [www.jenner.com](http://www.jenner.com)

## AUTHOR INFORMATION

- DAVID M. GREENWALD  
Partner  
Tel: 312 923-2774  
Fax: 312 840-7774  
E-Mail: [dgreenwald@jenner.com](mailto:dgreenwald@jenner.com)

## 2011 UPDATE TEAM LEADER

- MICHELE L. SLACHETKA  
Associate  
Tel: 312 840-8680  
Fax: 312-840-8780  
E-Mail: [mslachetka@jenner.com](mailto:mslachetka@jenner.com)

## CONTRIBUTING AUTHORS

- NICOLE ALLEN  
Associate  
Tel: 312 923-2868  
Fax: 312 923-2968  
E-Mail: [nallen@jenner.com](mailto:nallen@jenner.com)
- SARAH S. ANSARI  
Associate  
Tel: 312 840-7330  
Fax: 312 840-7430  
E-Mail: [sansari@jenner.com](mailto:sansari@jenner.com)
- JOSEPH R. DUNN  
Associate  
Tel: 312 840-7641  
Fax: 312 840-7741  
E-Mail: [jdunn@jenner.com](mailto:jdunn@jenner.com)
- EAMON P. KELLY  
Associate  
Tel: 312 840-7627  
Fax: 312 840-7727  
E-Mail: [ekelly@jenner.com](mailto:ekelly@jenner.com)

- **HILLARY B. LEVUN**  
Associate  
Tel: 312 923-8306  
Fax: 312 923-8406  
E-Mail: hlevun@jenner.com
- **MARISA K. PERRY**  
Associate  
Tel: 212 891-1623  
Fax: 212 909-0823  
E-Mail: mperry@jenner.com
- **RAVI S. SHANKAR**  
Associate  
Tel: 312 840-7673  
Fax: 312 840-7773  
E-Mail: rshankar@jenner.com
- **KATHERINE N. WELSH**  
Tel: 312 840-8652  
Fax: 312 840-8752  
E-Mail: kwelsh@jenner.com
- **ALEXANDER J. MAY**  
Associate  
Tel: 312 840-8659  
Fax: 312 840-8759  
E-Mail: amay@jenner.com
- **ERICA D. ROBERTS**  
Associate  
Tel: 312 840-8698  
Fax: 312 840-8798  
E-Mail: eroberts@jenner.com
- **CHRISTIE L. STARZEC**  
Associate  
Tel: 312 840-7692  
Fax: 312 840-7792  
E-Mail: cstarzec@jenner.com

© 2011 Jenner & Block LLP. This publication is not intended to provide legal advice but to provide general information on legal matters. Transmission is not intended to create and receipt does not establish an attorney-client relationship. Readers should seek specific legal advice before taking any action with respect to matters mentioned in this publication. The attorney responsible for this publication is David M. Greenwald.

ATTORNEY ADVERTISING

## APPRECIATION

Shortly after I joined Jenner & Block out of law school in 1986, Jerry Solovy “invited” me to work on the annual update of this outline, which he had initiated in 1984 largely in response to the U.S. Supreme Court’s decision in *Upjohn Co. v. United States*. Over the last 25 years, Jerry actively nurtured this work, which he called the firm’s “bestseller,” notwithstanding the fact that we provide it to our clients, friends and colleagues free of charge. Each week, Jerry would send memos and emails with suggestions for cases or articles that we should include in the next update and, as each year came to a close, increasingly earnest emails and phone calls asking when the next update would be ready for publication. This is the first year that Jerry will not see the newest edition. Jerry was truly a great leader in the legal community, and I will miss working with him on this project.

I want to thank some of the many people who have made contributions to this effort: My associate Michele Slachetka, who has led the team of lawyers who have devoted significant time to this year’s update. My associate Nicole Allen who, along with Michele, works with me on the privilege section of Jenner & Block’s monthly publication *The Spotlight Litigation Monitor* and on the firm’s Attorney-Client Privilege Resource Center, which is updated monthly and is available on our firm website. Sarah Ansari, Joseph Dunn, Eamon Kelly, Hillary Levun, Alexander May, Marisa Perry, Erica Roberts, Ravi Shankar, Christie Starzec, and Katherine Welsh, who have each contributed to the outline. My assistant, Sue Cihlar, who for more than ten years has made the revisions to the outline and put up with my demands for perfection. Finally, I would like to thank Anne Fitzpatrick, my former associate, who for many years led the update team and applied her pre-law school professional editor’s skills to the improvement of this publication.

David M. Greenwald  
April 2011

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<u>Page</u>
I. THE ATTORNEY-CLIENT PRIVILEGE.....	1
A. COMMUNICATIONS COVERED BY THE PRIVILEGE.....	2
1. Documents And Recorded Communications.....	2
2. Communicative Acts.....	3
3. Fees, Identity And The “Last Link”.....	4
4. Knowledge Of Underlying Facts Not Protected.....	8
5. Real Evidence And Chain Of Custody Not Protected.....	10
6. Communications From An Attorney To A Client Are Protected.....	10
a. The Narrow View: Only Advice Which Reveals Confidences Is Privileged.....	11
b. The Broader View: Content Irrelevant To Determination Of Whether Communication Is Privileged.....	12
c. Where Lawyer Acts Merely As A Conduit, Communications Are Not Protected.....	13
B. ONLY COMMUNICATIONS BETWEEN PRIVILEGED PERSONS ARE PROTECTED.....	14
1. Defining The Client.....	14
a. In general.....	14
b. Organizational Clients.....	16
(1) Defining The Organizational Client – <u>Upjohn</u> .....	16
(2) Representation Of Individual Employees By Organizational Counsel.....	20
(3) Former Employees Of Organizational Clients.....	24
(4) State Court Definitions Of The Organizational Client.....	26
(5) Privilege Within The Corporation.....	29
c. Government Agencies As Clients.....	30
2. Defining The Lawyer.....	31
a. In-House vs. Outside Counsel.....	32
b. Specially Appointed Counsel.....	34
c. Accountants As Privileged Parties.....	35
3. Defining Privileged Agents.....	37
a. Privileged Agents In General.....	37
b. Accountants As Privileged Agents.....	43
c. Public Relations Consultants.....	44
C. COMMUNICATIONS MUST BE INTENDED TO BE CONFIDENTIAL.....	45
1. Confidentiality In General.....	45
2. Confidentiality Within Organizations.....	48
3. Email And Confidentiality.....	50

D.	PRIVILEGE APPLIES ONLY TO COMMUNICATIONS MADE FOR THE PURPOSE OF SECURING LEGAL ADVICE.....	54
1.	Legal Purpose .....	54
2.	Cases Of Mixed Purpose.....	56
E.	ASSERTING THE PRIVILEGE .....	63
1.	Procedure For Asserting The Privilege.....	63
a.	Privilege Logs .....	65
b.	Electronic Mail and Other Electronic Data: Cost Shifting .....	71
c.	<i>In Camera</i> Review .....	76
d.	Maintaining the Privilege After Government Seizure of Documents or Other Monitoring of Communications .....	79
e.	Imposition Of Sanctions For Failure To Comply With Discovery Rules .....	80
f.	Obtaining Appellate Review Of A Court’s Decision Rejecting A Claim Of Privilege In Federal Courts .....	83
(1)	Appeal From Contempt Citation.....	84
(2)	Mandamus.....	85
(3)	Permissive Interlocutory Appeal.....	86
(4)	Standard Of Review .....	86
2.	Assertion of the Attorney-Client Privilege and Depositions of Counsel.....	87
3.	Assertion of the Privilege by Organizations: Employees and Successor Corporations.....	87
4.	Inferences Drawn From Assertion of Privilege .....	92
F.	DURATION OF THE PRIVILEGE .....	93
G.	WAIVING THE ATTORNEY-CLIENT PRIVILEGE .....	94
1.	Burden of Proof.....	94
2.	The Terminology Of Waiver .....	96
3.	Consent, Disclaimer And Defective Assertion .....	97
4.	Disclosure To Third Parties .....	99
a.	Intentional Disregard Of Confidentiality .....	99
b.	Disclosure Within A Corporation .....	103
c.	Disclosure To Auditors .....	104
5.	Authority To Waive Privilege.....	105
6.	The Extent Of Waiver .....	107
a.	Federal Rule of Evidence 502.....	108
(1)	FRE 502(a): Limited Subject Matter Waiver.....	110
(2)	FRE 502(b): Inadvertent Waiver .....	111
(3)	FRE 502(c): Disclosures Made in a State Proceeding ....	111
(4)	FRE 502(d) and (e): Court Orders and Party Agreements .....	111
b.	“Disclosure” vs. “Use”.....	113
c.	Pre-Litigation Disclosures .....	113

	d.	Partial Disclosure .....	113
7.		Disclosure To The Government.....	116
8.		Inadvertent Disclosure .....	117
9.		Involuntary Disclosure.....	125
10.		“At Issue” Claims And Defenses.....	127
	a.	Reliance On Advice Of Counsel.....	129
	b.	Lack Of Understanding.....	131
	c.	Diligence And Fraudulent Concealment.....	132
	d.	Extent Of “At Issue” Waiver .....	132
11.		Witness Use Of Documents.....	133
	a.	Refreshing Recollection Of Ordinary Witnesses.....	133
	b.	Use Of Documents By Experts .....	135
H.		DISCLOSURE TO THE GOVERNMENT.....	139
	1.	The “Culture of Waiver” & the Legal Community’s Response .....	139
		a. Legal Community Response .....	140
	2.	U.S. Attorney’s Manual – Disclosure of Known Facts and Non-Privileged Documents.....	142
	3.	Cooperation Under the SEC Enforcement Manual (2008) – Disclosure of All Relevant Facts .....	144
	4.	2010 Revisions to SEC Enforcement Manual Allow Privilege Waiver Requests .....	146
	5.	Selective Waiver .....	147
		a. The Rejection of the Selective Waiver Doctrine (Majority Rule) .....	148
		b. Recent Decisions in Support of Selective Waiver .....	151
		c. The Current Trend – Rejecting Selective Waiver.....	152
		d. Statutory Exception.....	153
	6.	FRE 502 – Limitation on Scope of Waiver .....	153
	7.	FRE 502 Protections In Other Proceedings: Practical Limitations.....	155
I.		EXCEPTIONS TO THE ATTORNEY-CLIENT PRIVILEGE .....	156
	1.	The Crime-Fraud Exception .....	156
	2.	Exception For Suits Against Former Attorney .....	164
	3.	Fiduciary Exception .....	165
		a. The <u>Garner</u> Doctrine .....	165
		b. Extension Of <u>Garner</u> Beyond Derivative Suits.....	168
		c. Disclosure Of Special Litigation Committee Reports .....	174
	4.	Internal Communications with Law Firm In-House Counsel.....	175
II.		EXTENSIONS OF THE ATTORNEY-CLIENT PRIVILEGE BASED ON COMMON INTEREST .....	178
A.		JOINT-DEFENSE PRIVILEGE.....	179
	1.	Waiver By Consent.....	181
	2.	Waiver By Subsequent Litigation.....	181
	3.	<u>In re Teleglobe</u> .....	181

B.	COMMON INTEREST DOCTRINE.....	183
1.	Waiver By Consent.....	190
2.	Waiver By Subsequent Litigation.....	190
3.	Extent of Waiver.....	191
C.	INSURANCE COMPANIES AND THE COMMON INTEREST DOCTRINE.....	191
1.	Protection Of Insurer/Insured Communications From Third Parties.....	191
2.	The Insurer’s Access To The Insured’s Privileged Communications .....	193
3.	Privilege Issues Arising Between Insurers And Reinsurers .....	195
III.	RECOMMENDATIONS FOR PRESERVING THE ATTORNEY-CLIENT PRIVILEGE.....	197
A.	LEGAL COMMUNICATIONS .....	197
B.	WITNESS INTERVIEWS.....	197
C.	EXPERTS .....	198
D.	CORPORATE EMPLOYEES .....	198
E.	DOCUMENT DISCOVERY .....	199
F.	DISCLOSURE TO GOVERNMENT AGENCIES.....	199
G.	ELECTRONIC COMMUNICATIONS.....	199
IV.	THE WORK PRODUCT DOCTRINE.....	200
A.	DEFINING WORK PRODUCT.....	203
1.	The Intangible Work Product Doctrine.....	203
2.	Work Product Must Be Prepared By Or For A Party Or By Or For Its Representative .....	204
3.	Work Product Must Be Prepared In Anticipation Of Imminent Litigation.....	207
a.	Required Imminence Of Litigation.....	208
b.	Preparation Of Documents Must Be Motivated By Litigation ....	210
(1)	Primary Motivating Factor Test.....	213
(2)	“Because Of” Test.....	215
(3)	“For Use In Litigation” Test .....	218
c.	Using Previously Prepared Documents In Subsequent Litigation.....	219
B.	ORDINARY AND OPINION WORK PRODUCT .....	222
1.	Opinion Work Product.....	222
a.	Selection Of Documents As Opinion Work Product .....	223
b.	Legal Theories By Themselves Are Not Opinion Work Product .....	226



2.	Ordinary Work Product.....	226
a.	Underlying Facts By Themselves Are Not Protected .....	227
3.	Mixed Opinion And Ordinary Work Product .....	229
C.	ASSERTING WORK PRODUCT PROTECTION.....	230
D.	SCOPE OF WORK PRODUCT PROTECTION .....	232
1.	Protection Of Ordinary Work Product.....	232
a.	“Substantial Need” .....	233
b.	“Undue Hardship” .....	234
2.	Protection Of Opinion Work Product .....	237
3.	Protection Of Mixed Opinion And Ordinary Work Product .....	239
E.	WAIVER OF WORK PRODUCT PROTECTION.....	240
1.	Consent, Disclaimer And Defective Assertion .....	240
2.	Selective Disclosure To Third Parties and Adversaries.....	240
3.	Disclosure To Auditors .....	243
4.	Partial Waiver: Extent Of Waiver.....	245
5.	Selective Waiver: Reporting To Government Agencies.....	247
6.	Inadvertent Disclosure .....	250
7.	“At Issue” Waiver .....	254
8.	Testimonial Use .....	256
9.	Use Of Documents By Witnesses And Experts.....	257
a.	Refreshing Recollection Of Fact Witnesses .....	257
b.	Use Of Documents By Experts .....	260
(1)	Pre-2010 Approach #1: Work Product Shown To Experts Not Protected .....	262
(2)	Pre-2010 Approach #2: Work Product Shown To Experts Is Discoverable Under A Balancing Approach ..	264
(3)	Pre-2010 Approach #3: Opinion Work Product Is Absolutely Protected Even If Shown To Experts .....	264
(4)	2010 Amendments to Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26 .....	266
F.	EXCEPTIONS TO WORK PRODUCT PROTECTION.....	269
1.	The Crime-Fraud Exception .....	269
a.	Ordinary Work Product.....	269
b.	Opinion Work Product.....	271
c.	Cases Where Lawyer Is Involved With Fraud But Client Is Ignorant .....	272
2.	Exception For Attorney Misconduct.....	272
3.	Fiduciary Exception: The <u>Garner</u> Doctrine.....	273
G.	COMMON INTEREST EXTENSIONS OF WORK PRODUCT PROTECTION.....	275

V.	RECOMMENDATIONS FOR PRESERVING THE CONFIDENTIALITY OF WORK PRODUCT.....	277
A.	LEGAL COMMUNICATIONS .....	277
B.	WITNESS STATEMENTS .....	277
C.	LEGAL INVESTIGATIONS .....	277
VI.	SELF-CRITICAL ANALYSIS PRIVILEGE.....	278
VII.	GOVERNMENTAL DELIBERATIVE PROCESS PRIVILEGE .....	286
A.	ELEMENTS OF THE PRIVILEGE .....	288
1.	Intra- And Inter-Agency Communications .....	288
2.	Predecisional Communications.....	290
3.	Deliberative Documents.....	293
4.	Factual Material May Not Be Privileged .....	295
B.	LIMITATIONS OF THE PRIVILEGE .....	298
1.	Balancing Test .....	298
2.	Exceptions To Balancing Test .....	299
a.	Governmental Misconduct.....	299
b.	Decision-Making Process At Issue .....	300
C.	WAIVER OF THE PRIVILEGE .....	301
D.	PROCESS OF INVOKING THE PRIVILEGE.....	302
1.	Delegation Of Authority To Assert The Privilege.....	302
2.	Burden Of Proof.....	303
3.	Affidavits And “Vaughn Index” .....	304
4.	<i>In Camera</i> Review .....	306
E.	EXTENSIONS OF THE DELIBERATIVE PROCESS PRIVILEGE .....	307
1.	Local Legislators.....	307
2.	State Agencies.....	307
3.	Decisional And Mental Processes.....	308
4.	Bank Examinations .....	309
VIII.	PRESERVING THE ATTORNEY-CLIENT PRIVILEGE AND THE CONFIDENTIALITY OF WORK PRODUCT DURING DEPOSITION PREPARATION AND TESTIMONY .....	310
A.	INSTRUCTIONS NOT TO ANSWER .....	310
B.	SPECIAL CIRCUMSTANCES – RULE 30(b)(6) DEPOSITIONS AND DEPOSITIONS OF COUNSEL .....	313
C.	DEPOSITION PREPARATION .....	320

IX.	INTERNAL INVESTIGATIONS .....	323
	A. THE COURTS’ ANALYSIS OF ASSERTIONS OF PRIVILEGE OVER INVESTIGATIVE MATERIALS .....	323
	B. THE ATTORNEY-CLIENT PRIVILEGE .....	324
	1. Only Communications Protected .....	328
	2. Privilege May Extend To Consultants .....	329
	3. Intended Beneficiary Of The Privilege .....	330
	C. WORK PRODUCT DOCTRINE .....	332
	1. Witness Statements .....	335
	2. Employment Discrimination Cases: “At Issue” Waiver .....	337
	D. RECOMMENDATIONS FOR PROTECTING INTERNAL INVESTIGATION MATERIALS .....	342
X.	SPECIAL PROBLEM AREAS .....	345
	A. CHOICE OF LAW: IDENTIFYING THE APPLICABLE LAW .....	345
	B. SHAREHOLDER LITIGATION .....	347
	C. ETHICAL CONSIDERATIONS .....	347
	1. Dual Representation .....	347
	2. Former Employees .....	350
	D. POST-ENRON CONSIDERATIONS .....	351
	E. LOBBYING .....	355
	1. Attorney-Client Privilege .....	355
	2. Attorney Work Product .....	356
XI.	PATENTS .....	357
	A. PATENTS AND LEGAL ADVICE .....	357
	B. WAIVER OF PRIVILEGE AND THE GOOD FAITH RELIANCE ON ADVICE OF COUNSEL DEFENSE TO WILLFUL INFRINGEMENT .....	358
	1. Scope Of The Waiver .....	360
	2. Bifurcating Trial And Staying Discovery .....	363
	C. THE INEQUITABLE CONDUCT DEFENSE AND THE CRIME-FRAUD EXCEPTION .....	365

D. APPLICATION OF PRIVILEGE TO FOREIGN PATENT AGENT  
COMMUNICATIONS .....368

E. THE COMMON INTEREST DOCTRINE IN THE PATENT CONTEXT .....371

APPENDIX A – JOINT/COMMON DEFENSE AGREEMENT ..... A-1